Interactive comment on “Unified parameterization of the planetary boundary layer and shallow convection with a higher-order turbulence closure in the community atmosphere model: single column experiments” by P. A. Bogenschutz et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 24 August 2012

This manuscript describes the implementation of the CLUBB parameterization into the single-column version of CAM5. The implementation is tested with a number of relevant cases and sensitivity with respect to vertical grid spacing and time step is explored. Overall, these early results are very encouraging.

The manuscript would benefit from a few clarifications or modifications:

- On some of the vertical profile figures, it would be useful to add profiles of $\theta_l$ and $q_t$ as these variables can reveal the integrated impact of the parameterization fluxes.
- Describe in more details the coupling between CLUBB and MG. Are CLUBB predicted pdfs being used in the microphysics? Are there any changes to the microphysics?
- P 1744, line 23: "Medieros" -> "Medeiros"
- P 1746, line 1: Larson and Golaz (2005, doi:10.1175/MWR2902.1) is also be relevant here.
- P 1747, line 11: "2011" -> "2010" according to the references.
- P 1748, line 11: does CLUBB predict $\overline{u'w'}$ and $\overline{v'w'}$?
- P 1748, line 13: $\tilde{q}_l$ -> $\tilde{q}_t$
- P 1748, second paragraph: how is the turbulence transport of scalars handled in CAM-CLUBB?
- P 1748, last paragraph. Please define SGS vertical velocity. Clarify how is it computed for LES, CAM-BASE and CAM-CLUBB. Also clarify elsewhere in the text where references are made to the SGS vertical velocity. For CAM-CLUBB, an alternative approach would be to integrate over the pdf of $w$ predicted by CLUBB.
- P 1749, first paragraph. Tighter coupling between CLUBB and the microphysics may also help in representing aerosol effects on cloud dynamics (Guo et al, 2011, doi:10.1029/2011GL048611).
- P 1752 and Figure 2: CAM-BASE results for BOMEX cloud fraction appear to be substantially degraded compared to Bretherton et al. 2004 and Park and Bretherton (2009). Please elaborate in the text.
Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., 5, 1743, 2012.