Interactive comment on “A hybrid Eulerian Lagrangian numerical scheme for solving prognostic equations in fluid dynamics” by E. Kaas et al.

H. Weller (Editor)

h.weller@reading.ac.uk

Received and published: 13 September 2013

This is a well written article. The description of the model is clear and the tracer transport tests are well chosen and compelling. However I do not see why the authors chose the shallow water tests that they did. It would be more informative if they could do standard shallow water tests that have been used many times before in order to allow readers to compare results with other models. I refer to:

Williamson et al, JCP, 1992
Galewsky, Scott, Lorenzo and Polvani, Tellus, 2004

The authors should either do one or two of the commonest of the above tests or have a VERY good reason why they have chosen non-standard shallow water tests