

Interactive comment on “FORHYCS v1.0: A spatially distributed model combining hydrology and forest dynamics” by Matthias J. R. Speich et al.

David Ham

david.ham@imperial.ac.uk

Received and published: 14 August 2019

This comment addresses the compliance of this manuscript with the GMD policy on code and data availability. The issues raised here must be satisfactorily addressed before a revised manuscript can be accepted for publication.

This paper presents a new coupled model. The source code of this model is substantially absent, with seemingly only a few files that have been particularly modified being presented in the supplement. The excuse provided is that the model would be of limited use to others due to internally defined data formats. This excuse does not address the reasons that source code is required for GMD publication. These are addressed

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



in detail in the recent GMD editorial¹, however the core point is that it is only with access to the source code that a reader can actually determine what a model really does. Providing a few exemplary fragments does not satisfy this.

On the specific subject of file formats, the manuscript types page of the GMD website² is explicit that manuals should also be provided. At a minimum one would expect that any input or output file formats would be adequately documented.

The full model source code, as well as any other files required to run the examples presented in the manuscript, needs to be placed in a persistent public archive in line with GMD policy, and appropriately cited from the code availability section.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2019-117>, 2019.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

¹<https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-12-2215-2019>

²https://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/about/manuscript_types.html

